CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Sixty-ninth meeting of the Standing Committee Geneva (Switzerland), 27 November -1 December 2017

Species specific matters

Eels (Anguilla spp.)

ILLEGAL TRADE IN ANGUILLA ANGUILLA

- 1. This document has been submitted by the European Union (EU).*
- 2. The European Eel Anguilla anguilla was listed in CITES Appendix II at CoP14 in 2007 and the listing came into force in March 2009. Due to its depleted status within Europe, the EU has been unable to make a positive non-detriment finding for the species since December 2010. Currently export and import of this species from and into the EU is not permitted, and all EU Member States have published a zero export quota for European Eel since 2011. To improve the conservation status of the species, the EU adopted in 2007 a domestic legislation¹ on eel conservation, establishing measures for the recovery of the stock of European Eel. In accordance with the obligations set out in this Regulation, Member States of the EU have developed species management plans at national level, which include management measures (e.g. reduction in fisheries, improving river continuity, reducing pollution).
- 3. Since the introduction of the EU trade suspension for *A. Anguilla*, illegal export of live juvenile eels (glass eels) from the EU to third countries has substantially increased. The information available suggests that glass eels traded illegally from the EU are shipped to farming facilities in Asia, where they are kept until they reach their adult size and further re-exported to their final market, sometimes mixed with other eel species. Peaks in illegal trade in *A. anguilla* usually take place during the fishing season for glass eels, which runs from October to Spring. The illegal trade in glass eels of *A. anguilla* is jeopardising efforts for the recovery of the species and undermining the implementation of the Convention. It should be noted that the legal and illegal international trade in other eel species has also increased in recent years².
- 4. Recalling that CITES Decision 17.189 directs the Standing Committee to "consider information relating to illegal trade in European eel at its 69th and 70th meetings and adopt recommendations as appropriate", the present document provides an update on the latest trends in detected cases of illegal trade in European Eel.
- 5. Table 1 provides a non-exhaustive summary of *A. anguilla* seizure information for 2013-2017 collated from a variety of sources CITES Biennial Reports, EU Member State seizures reports, EU-TWIX, Europol, the Sustainable Eel Group and media reports. These include internal (illegally fished eels) and external seizures (on both import and export) and provide further evidence that illegal trade, in particular exports of *A. anguilla* glass eels, has continued in recent years.
- 6. The available seizure information suggests a rampant illegal trade in the species, with shifting and complex (i.e. indirect) trade routes and modes of shipment to avoid detection. Recent investigations in the EU point

^{*} The geographical designations employed in this document do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the CITES Secretariat (or the United Nations Environment Programme) concerning the legal status of any country, territory, or area, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The responsibility for the contents of the document rests exclusively with its author.

¹ Council Regulation (EC) No. 1100/2007.

² https://cites.org/sites/default/files/eng/cop/17/WorkingDocs/E-CoP17-51.pdf

to the involvement of organized criminal networks in this illegal trade, which reportedly use falsified documents and launder the large profits generated through their illegal operations. According to the latest investigations in 2017, 10 tonnes of European Eel are believed to have been smuggled in the 2016-2017 fishing season from the EU to China, with a profit estimated at EUR 10 million. Evidence from recent enforcement operations point to the involvement of actors in the source, transit and destination countries.

7. Addressing illegal trade in *A. anguilla* is a priority for enforcement agencies from the EU Member States. Together with the European Union's law enforcement agency (Europol), they have strengthened their efforts against eel trafficking and carried out joint operations to dismantle the criminal networks organising it. Operational activities during the fishing season 2016-2017 have seen 48 persons arrested and 4 000 kg of glass eels seized, amounting to a total value of approximately EUR 4 million³. In view of the transnational nature of eel trafficking, international enforcement cooperation needs to be increased to tackle this illegal trade effectively, especially through sharing of intelligence via appropriate channels, carrying out joint enforcement operations and the identification and prosecution of the leaders of the criminal networks driving this trade in demand countries.

Recommendation

- 8. The Standing Committee is invited to:
 - a) take note of the document, and
 - b) encourage all range, export, transit and import countries to strengthen their cooperation in addressing international illegal trade in *Anguilla anguilla*.

³ <u>https://www.europol.europa.eu/newsroom/news/eu-law-enforcement-step-efforts-to-protect-environment-%E2%80%93-48-arrested-for-trafficking-endangered-species</u>

Table 1 - Anguilla anguilla seizure information for 2013-2017 collated from a variety of sources.

Source: 2013-2014 CITES Biennial Reports, EU Member State seizures reports, EU-TWIX database and mailing list, Europol, the Sustainable Eel Group and open sources (such as press releases by enforcement agencies or, in a few cases, media reports).

| Country of seizure | Date | Commodity | Quantity, kg ⁴ | Direction of trade | Seizure/Route details |
|-----------------------|------------|-----------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------------|--|
| France | 08/01/2013 | Live glass eels | 7.0 | Internal (EU) | Seized from a vehicle on a road, illegally fished |
| Spain | 11/08/2013 | Meat | 24 000.0 | Export (from the EU) | Seizure made at a maritime port, shipment did not have CITES documentation |
| France | 25/11/2013 | Live glass eels | 70.0 | Internal (EU) | Seized from a vehicle, illegally fished |
| Italy | 20/12/2013 | Live eels | 600 specimens | Internal (EU) | Italian origin, illegally fished |
| Portugal | 00/12/2013 | Live eels | 270.0 | Export (from the EU) | Found in air freight hidden amongst other goods, on way to China |
| France | 19/02/2014 | Live glass eels | 312.0 | Internal (EU) | Seized from a vehicle, illegally fished |
| Hungary | 23/04/2014 | Live glass eels | 182.0 | Export/Import | Seized at Budapest airport, Hungary from two Chinese citizens in personal luggage, based on intelligence information received from the Spanish CITES Management Authority. Destination of the shipment would have been Hong Kong SAR via Moscow, Russian Federation . Shipment was first smuggled out from the EU and sent back in Moscow, being seized on arrival to Budapest. Eels originated in Spain . |
| Portugal | 00/02/2014 | Live eels | 272.0 | Export (from the EU) | Two airport seizures, found in freight hidden amongst other goods, with wrong Customs code being used, on way to China |
| Hong Kong SAR | 00/04/2014 | Live glass eels | 108.0 | Import (into Hong Kong SAR) | Customs documentation showed that other glass eel shipments had left from Budapest airport, Hungary on 21/04/2014, destined for Hong Kong SAR. Hungarian authorities informed Hong Kong CITES authorities and based on this information Hong Kong SAR seized two glass eel shipments, also originating from Spain . |
| Italy | 11/12/2014 | Live eels | 500 specimens | Internal (EU) | Italian origin, illegally fished |
| Portugal | 22/11/2014 | Live glass eels | 15.0 | Internal (EU) | Seized at a river port, illegally fished, believed to be destined for China |
| Germany | 24/11/2014 | Meat | 10.0 | Import (into the EU) | Seized in air freight coming from Egypt |
| China | 14/01/2014 | Live glass eels | n/a | Import (into China) | Twelve boxes of eel fry carried by a passenger from Germany without documents were seized at Beijing Airport. Shipment was on its way to Fujian Province. |

⁴ Seizure reports often do not specify if the amount seized is net or gross mass (i.e. if the mass includes the fish only or if it also includes the water in which they were transported).

| Country of seizure | Date | Commodity | Quantity, kg⁴ | Direction of trade | Seizure/Route details |
|--------------------|------------|-----------------|-----------------------|-----------------------------------|---|
| Bulgaria | 21/01/2015 | Live glass eels | 37.0 | Import (into the EU) | Sofia Airport, Bulgaria: X-ray inspection found glass eels in luggage of two Chinese citizens arriving from Madrid, Spain . Eels were in eight Styrofoam containers, declared as food and were reportedly bought at a market in Spain. |
| Poland | 06.04.2015 | Meat | 534,75 | Export (from the EU) | On 06.04.15 at the road border point with the Russian Federation , customs seized 534,75 kg of frozen eels concealed in one of the walls of a car, designed to exported from the EU. DNA tests proved it was European eels (Anguilla anguilla). |
| Poland | 14.04.2015 | Meat | 20,6 | Import (into the EU) | On 14.04.15 at the same border point (as above) Customs seized 20,6 kg of frozen European eel (Anguilla anguilla) specimens. This time it was an import attempt from the Russian Federation . Goods were not concealed. Species identification was based on DNA testing. |
| France | 06/02/2015 | Live glass eels | 120.0 | Export (from the EU) | Seized at airport, freight destined for Hong Kong SAR . Eels in 12 boxes, declared "Small eels", origin UK |
| France | 18/03/2015 | Live eels | 11.8 | Import (into the EU) | Seized on a road, unknown country of origin |
| France | 20/03/2015 | Live eels | 6.5 | Export (from the EU) | Seized at airport, destined for French Polynesia |
| Germany | 09/2015 | Meat | 24 000.0 ⁵ | Import (into the EU) | Found in a container from China at a maritime port based on an investigation |
| Cyprus | 11/2015 | Meat | 100.0 | Import (EU) | Detected in a container from China . DNA testing was conducted by Germany before releasing the shipment to Cyprus |
| France | no date | Live glass eels | 42.0 | Export (from the EU) | Seized at airport, originating in Spain, destined for China, found in personal baggage |
| France | 2016 | Live glass eels | 25.0 | Internal (EU) | Found inside a vehicle on the way to Spain |
| France | 2016 | Live glass eels | 163.0 | Internal (EU) | Found inside a vehicle during random control |
| France | 2016 | Live glass eels | 2.0 | Internal (EU) | Found inside a vehicle during random control |
| Hong Kong SAR | 01/2016 | Live glass eels | 109.0 | Import (into Hong Kong SAR) | The shipment arrived by air from Spain via the UAE , in personal baggage. Four passengers were arrested |
| Hong Kong SAR | 02/2016 | Live glass eels | 48.0 | Import (into Hong Kong SAR) | The shipment arrived by air from Spain via France , in personal baggage |

⁵ Only15-20% of the meat have been identified as meat from Anguilla anguilla. The remaining rest was meat from other Anguilla species.

| Country of seizure | Date | Commodity | Quantity, kg ⁴ | Direction of trade | Seizure/Route details |
|--------------------|------------|-----------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------------|--|
| Hong Kong SAR | 02/2016 | Live glass eels | 30.0 | Import (into Hong Kong SAR) | The shipment arrived by air from Portugal via the UAE , in personal baggage |
| Spain | 02/2016 | Live glass eels | 36.0 | Export (from EU) | The shipment was found in personal baggage at an airport destined to China via France |
| Spain | 02-03/2016 | Live glass eels | 86.0 | Export (from EU) | Two seizures: the shipments were found in personal baggage at an airport destined to China via the Netherlands |
| Spain | 01/03/2016 | Live glass eels | 111.0 | Export (from EU) | Four seizures: the shipments were found in personal baggage at an airport destined to Hong Kong SAR |
| Hong Kong SAR | 03/2016 | Live glass eels | 63.0 | Import (into Hong Kong SAR) | The shipment was carried by two passengers by air from Spain via Turkey , in personal baggage |
| Hong Kong SAR | 03/2016 | Live glass eels | 91.0 | Import (into Hong Kong SAR) | The shipment arrived by air from Spain via the Netherlands, in personal baggage |
| Hong Kong SAR | 11/2016 | Live glass eels | 14.0 | Import (into Hong Kong SAR) | The shipment arrived in cargo from Morocco |
| Italy | 12/2016 | Live eels | 35.0 | Import (into the EU) | Seized at Rome (FCO) airport coming from Egypt, shipment did not have CITES documentation |
| Hong Kong SAR | 12/2016 | Live glass eels | 76.0 | Import (into Hong Kong SAR) | The shipment arrived by air from Spain via the Netherlands, in personal baggage |
| France | 16/01/17 | Live glass eels | 792 | Export (from the EU) | Seized on a road, on way to Roissy airport and then Thailand |
| France | 03/02/17 | Live glass eels | 200 | Export (from the EU) | Seized at Roissy airport, on way to Thailand |
| France | 06/03/17 | Live glass eels | 200 | Internal (EU) | Seized on a road, on way to Spain |
| Greece/Spain | 03/2017 | Live glass eels | 2000.0 | Export (from EU) | An international criminal network dismantled in an operation by Greek and Spanish authorities, supported by Europol and Eurojust: the eels were destined to China , 17 individuals arrested, also seized: data storage devices, documents, luxury cars, EUR 1 million in cash and gold bars |
| United Kingdom | 03/2017 | Live glass eels | 200.0 | Export (from EU) | The eels originated from Spain and were in transit to Hong Kong SAR by air |
| China | 03/2017 | Live glass eels | 88.0 | Import (into China) | The shipment arrived from Turkey |

| Country of seizure | Date | Commodity | Quantity, kg ⁴ | Direction of trade | Seizure/Route details |
|-----------------------|---------|-----------------|------------------------------|-----------------------------------|---|
| Hong Kong SAR | 03/2017 | Live glass eels | 24.9 | Import (into Hong Kong SAR) | The shipment arrived from Morocco via Qatar |
| Hong Kong SAR | 03/2017 | Live glass eels | 14.8 | Import (into Hong Kong SAR) | The shipment arrived from Portugal via Turkey |
| Hong Kong SAR | 03/2017 | Live glass eels | 25.4 | Import (into Hong Kong SAR) | The shipment arrived from Morocco via the UAE |
| Hong Kong SAR | 03/2017 | Live glass eels | 14.3 | Import (into Hong Kong SAR) | The shipment arrived from Spain via France and China |
| Netherlands | 04/2017 | Live glass eels | 72.0 | Export (from EU) | The shipment was found in personal baggage at an airport in transit from Portugal to China |
| China | 04/2017 | Live glass eels | NA (68 bags) | Import (into China) | Shanghai Customs seized the shipment from three passengers. No further information available |
| China | 04/2017 | Live glass eels | 200.0 | Import (into China) | The flight arrived from the Netherlands and the eels are suspected to originate from Portugal. Intercepted in Hangzhou |